

1 Paul Alexander (C.S.B. #49997)
George Langendorf (C.S.B. #255563)
2 ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP
10th Floor
3 Three Embarcadero Center
San Francisco, CA 94111-4024
4 Telephone: (415) 471-3122
5 Facsimile: (415) 471-3400

6 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

ELECTRONICALLY
FILED
*Superior Court of California,
County of San Francisco*
12/14/2017
Clerk of the Court
BY: RONNIE OTERO
Deputy Clerk

7
8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
10

11 CALIFORNIA DENTAL ASSOCIATION, a
California Corporation;
12 RICHARD W. BARNES, D.D.S.;
ROBERT E. REED, D.D.S.;
13 DEAN SCHWEITZER, D.D.S.;
GERALD MIDDLETON, D.D.S.;
14 WHITNEY JOHNSON, D.D.S.;
TERRENCE Y. LAU, D.D.S.,
15 BARBARA M. HAWTHORNE, D.D.S.,
individually and on behalf of all others
16 similarly situated,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 vs.

19 DELTA DENTAL OF CALIFORNIA, a
California Corporation,

20 Defendant.
21

Case No.: CGC-14-538849

**DECLARATION OF BARBARA M.
HAWTHORNE, DDS**

Date: December 27, 2017
Time: 10:30 a.m.
Judge: Hon. Mary E. Wiss
Dept.: 305

22
23 I, Barbara M. Hawthorne, DDS, hereby declare as follows:

24 1. I am a licensed California dentist and, prior to my retirement in 2013, was a member
25 of the "Premier network" of dentists of Delta Dental of California pursuant to a Participating
26 Dentist Agreement ("PDA"). I have been a licensed California dentist since 1979 and was a
27 member of the Delta Dental Premier network since 1998. I was a member of the California Dental
28 Association from 1979-1994 but I ended my membership in 1994 and was not a member from

1 1994-2013 when I retired. The matters set forth herein are based on my personal knowledge unless
2 otherwise indicated. This Declaration supplements my previous declaration in this case dated April
3 18, 2017, which is incorporated herein.

4 2. I understand that, subsequent to the Court's Order of April 21, 2017 granting
5 preliminary approval to the initial settlement agreement in this matter, the parties discovered a
6 miscalculation of the financial impact of Delta Dental's application of the INAP, and that the parties
7 have now recalculated that impact, and reached an Amended Settlement Agreement that includes
8 \$65,029,299 in payments to be allocated among dentists whose fees and been improperly limited by
9 Delta Dental. I have reviewed the Amended Settlement Agreement and had the opportunity to
10 discuss its provisions with Class Counsel. The change in the Settlement Amount in the Amended
11 Settlement Agreement from \$34,750,000 to \$65,029,299 is a very positive change from the
12 standpoint of the Premier dentist Class Members. Based on everything I know about the facts and
13 circumstances that produced the Amended Settlement Agreement, I have concluded that it is fair
14 and reasonable and, overall, a very good settlement for Class Members.

15 3. As of today, I do not know what, if any, actual monetary recovery will be paid to me
16 personally and my conclusion about the fairness and reasonableness of the settlement is not based
17 on the expectation that I personally will receive any particular monetary payment as a result of the
18 amended settlement. Rather, I believe it is fair and reasonable to require Delta Dental to reimburse
19 dentists for a significant portion of previous fee limitations that are claimed to be in breach of
20 contract, and that the amount that each dentist receive from the cash portion of the settlement be
21 related to the amount of actual harm that each dentist sustained, which is what I understand the
22 principle behind the allocation of the cash portion of the settlement to be. I am also in agreement
23 that the calculation of these allocations be based on the computerized records that Delta Dental has
24 maintained, because it would be very difficult for dentists such as me to do going all the way back
25 to 2011 and access financial records, some of which may have been lost or destroyed over the years.

26 4. Assuming the Court confirms my appointment as a class representative, I will
27 continue to work with counsel, to review materials related to the case and the amended settlement,
28 to participate in communications and conference calls concerning the case and the amended

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

settlement, and to act in a manner consistent with the interest of all California dentists in the class. I understand that all dentists who are a part of the class, whether members of CDA or not, should be treated equally and that is the approach that I have taken and will continue to take as a class representative if approved by the court.

5. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Executed in Laguna Beach, California on December 13, 2017.


Barbara M. Hawthorne, DDS